

**TRANSLATION**

**PATENT COOPERATION TREATY**

**PCT**

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY**

(Chapter II of the Patent Cooperation Treaty)

(PCT Article 36 and Rule 70)

Applicant's or agent's file reference <b>SP23938 PM</b>	<b>FOR FURTHER ACTION</b>		See Form PCT/IPEA/416
International application No. <b>PCT/FR2004/050640</b>	International filing date ( <i>day/month/year</i> ) <b>02.12.2004</b>	Priority date ( <i>day/month/year</i> ) <b>05.12.2003</b>	
International Patent Classification (IPC) or national classification and IPC <b>H04M3/56</b>			
Applicant <b>FRANCE TELECOM</b>			
<p>1. This report is the international preliminary examination report, established by this International Preliminary Examining Authority under Article 35 and transmitted to the applicant according to Article 36.</p> <p>2. This REPORT consists of a total of <b>6</b> sheets, including this cover sheet.</p> <p>3. This report is also accompanied by ANNEXES, comprising:</p> <p>a. <input type="checkbox"/> (<i>sent to the applicant and to the International Bureau</i>) a total of _____ sheets, as follows:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> sheets of the description, claims and/or drawings which have been amended and are the basis for this report and/or sheets containing rectifications authorized by this Authority (see Rule 70.16 and Section 607 of the Administrative Instructions).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> sheets which supersede earlier sheets, but which this Authority considers contain an amendment that goes beyond the disclosure in the international application as filed, as indicated in item 4 of Box No. I and the Supplemental Box.</p> <p>b. <input type="checkbox"/> (<i>sent to the International Bureau only</i>) a total of (indicate type and number of electronic carrier(s)) _____, containing a sequence listing and/or tables related thereto, in computer readable form only, as indicated in the Supplemental Box Relating to Sequence Listing (see Section 802 of the Administrative Instructions).</p> <p>4. This report contains indications relating to the following items:</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Box No. I Basis of the report</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. II Priority</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. III Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. IV Lack of unity of invention</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Box No. V Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. VI Certain documents cited</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Box No. VII Certain defects in the international application</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. VIII Certain observations on the international application</p>			

Date of submission of the demand	Date of completion of this report
Name and mailing address of the IPEA/EP	Authorized officer
Facsimile No.	Telephone No.

## INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY

International application No.  
PCT/FR2004/050640

## Box No. I Basis of the report

1. With regard to the language, this report is based on the international application in the language in which it was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.
 

This report is based on translations from the original language into the following language \_\_\_\_\_, which is the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of:
 
  - international search (Rule 12.3 and 23.1(b))
  - publication of the international application (Rule 12.4)
  - international preliminary examination (Rule 55.2 and/or 55.3)
2. With regard to the elements of the international application, this report is based on (*replacement sheets which have been furnished to the receiving Office in response to an invitation under Article 14 are referred to in this report as "originally filed" and are not annexed to this report*):
 

the international application as originally filed/furnished  
 the description:  
 pages 1-15 \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished  
 pages\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
 pages\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
 the claims:  
 nos. 1-14 \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished  
 nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ as amended (together with any statement) under Article 19  
 nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
 nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
 the drawings:  
 sheets 1/5-5/5 \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished  
 sheets\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
 sheets\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
 a sequence listing and/or any related table(s) – see Supplemental Box Relating to Sequence Listing.
3.  The amendments have resulted in the cancellation of:
 

the description, pages \_\_\_\_\_  
 the claims, nos. \_\_\_\_\_  
 the drawings, sheets/figs \_\_\_\_\_  
 the sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_  
 any table(s) related to sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_
4.  This report has been established as if (some of) the amendments annexed to this report and listed below had not been made, since they have been considered to go beyond the disclosure as filed, as indicated in the Supplemental Box (Rule 70.2(c)).
 

the description, pages \_\_\_\_\_  
 the claims, nos. \_\_\_\_\_  
 the drawings, sheets/figs \_\_\_\_\_  
 the sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_  
 any table(s) related to sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_

\* If item 4 applies, some or all of those sheets may be marked "superseded."

## INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY

International application No.  
PCT/FR2004/050640

**Box No. V Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement**

## 1. Statement

Novelty (N)	Claims <u>2-7, 9-14</u>	YES
	Claims <u>1, 8</u>	NO
Inventive step (IS)	Claims _____	YES
	Claims <u>1-14</u>	NO
Industrial applicability (IA)	Claims <u>1-14</u>	YES
	Claims _____	NO

## 2. Citations and explanations (Rule 70.7)

Reference is made to the following documents:

D1: WO 03/055188 A (ROBERTS LINDA ANN; CHANG E-LEE (US); CARTER SHARON E (US); NGUYEN) 3 July 2003

D2: WO 03/055187 A (ROBERTS LINDA ANN; SILVER EDWARD MICHAEL (US); NGUYEN HONG THI (US) 3 July 2003

The considerations of the applicant have been studied attentively.

1. The present application fails to meet the requirements of PCT Article 33(1), since the subject matter of claim 1 does not comply with the criterion of novelty as defined by PCT Article 33(2).

D1 describes (the references between parentheses apply to said document) a device for remotely managing conferences, comprising:

- means for receiving, from a telephone conference bridge, data on the presence of participants in an audio conference, referred to as audio presence data (page 14, lines 13 to 22; figure 3);
- storage means for storing data with regard to

## INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY

International application No.  
PCT/FR2004/050640

Box No. V	Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement
<p>users' telephone numbers and data identifying users' apparatus, correlating with the telephone number data (page 14, line 29; figure 3);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- means for determining, by means of the audio presence data and the stored data, the apparatus of participants in a conference (page 14, line 30 to page 15, line 9).</li></ul> <p>2. Dependent claims 2 to 7 contain no feature which, when combined with the features of any one of the claims to which they refer, defines subject matter that complies with the PCT requirements of inventive step.</p> <p>In particular:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- claim 2 "... telephone numbers..."</li><li>- claim 3 "...sending conference data to the participants' apparatus..."</li><li>- claim 4 "...identifying a query..."</li><li>- claim 5 "...determining what type of data..."</li><li>- claim 6 "...to other users' apparatus..."</li><li>- claim 7 "...system..."</li></ul> <p>are merely some of several obvious options that a person skilled in the art seeking to solve the stated problem might select, depending on each particular case, and without an inventive step being involved.</p> <p>3.1 Since claim 8 contains features equivalent, <i>mutatis mutandis</i>, to those of claim 1, the present application fails to meet the requirements of PCT Article 33(1), and the subject matter of claim 8 does not comply with the criterion of novelty as defined by PCT Article 33(2).</p>	

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY**International application No.  
PCT/FR2004/050640**Box No. V**      **Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement**

3.2 Dependent claims 9 to 14 contain no feature which, when combined with the features of any one of the claims to which they refer, defines subject matter that complies with the PCT requirements of inventive step.

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY**

International application No.

PCT/FR2004/050640

**Box No. VII      Certain defects in the international application**

The following defects in the form or contents of the international application have been noted:

Contrary to the requirement of PCT Rule 5.1(a)(ii), the relevant prior art disclosed in D1 and D2 has not been indicated in the description, nor have said documents been cited.